



## HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

2 Fairgrounds Road  
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554  
[www.nantucket-ma.gov](http://www.nantucket-ma.gov)

**Commissioners:** Linda Williams (Chair), Dawn Hill-Holdgate (Vice-chair), John McLaughlin, David Barham, Diane Coombs  
**Associate Commissioners:** Jascin Leonardo-Finger, Abigail Camp **Staff:** Mark Voigt, James Grieder

### ~~ MINUTES ~~

### October 3, 2013 – OLD BUSINESS

Public Safety Facility, 4 Fairgrounds Road, Training Room –1:00 p.m.

Called to order at 1:07 p.m.

Staff in attendance: J. Grieder, HDC Assistant Administrator; T. Norton, Town Minutes Taker

Attending Members: Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Camp

Absent Members: Barham, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger,

Late Arrivals: Hill-Holdgate 1:46 p.m.

Early Departures: Hill-Holdgate 2:38 p.m.

Agenda adopted by unanimous consent

#### I. PUBLIC COMMENT

None

#### II. CONSENT

1. None

#### III. OLD BUSINESS

1. Cribbins	68 Sankaty Road – SAB	Garage revisions	49-187	Shelter 7
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	<b>Jason Olbres</b> , Shelter 7 LLC – Reviewed project.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(1:11) No concerns.			
	The pool application to go on the October 8 agenda.			
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve. (McLaughlin)</b>			
Vote	Carried unanimously	<b>Certificate #</b>	<b>60334</b>	
2. Westfall	30 Monomoy Road	Hardscaping: pool	54-210	CWA
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns	(1:14) Lacks a quorum.			
Motion	<b>Motion to Hold for beginning of Oct 8 due to lack of quorum. (Camp)</b>			
Vote	Carried unanimously	<b>Certificate #</b>		

<b>3. Lynch, Michael</b>	<b>58A Orange Street – HSAB</b>	<b>New dwelling</b>	<b>55.4.1-792</b>	<b>SMRD</b>
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Joe Topper, S.M. Roethke Design Michael Lynch			
Public	None			
Concerns	(1:15) <b>Staff</b> – Read previous concerns from Sept. 17. <b>McLaughlin</b> – East elevation shutters on the 2 <sup>nd</sup> floor are inappropriate.			
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve through staff with the removal of the east elevation 2<sup>nd</sup>-floor shutter.</b>			
Vote	Carried unanimously	<b>Certificate #</b>	<b>60335</b>	
	Motion to ratify approval of the demolition of the garage.	(McLaughlin)		
	Carried 2-1/Camp opposed			
<b>4. Morency</b>	<b>11 Marsh Hawk Lane</b>	<b>Addition</b>	<b>56-112</b>	<b>N. McMullen</b>
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	<b>Nathan McMullen</b> – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(1:20) <b>Staff</b> – Read previous concerns from Sept. 12 No concerns.			
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve. (McLaughlin)</b>			
Vote	Carried unanimously	<b>Certificate #</b>	<b>60336</b>	
<b>5. Bazinet</b>	<b>15 Burnell Street – SAB</b>	<b>New dwelling</b>	<b>73.4.2-48.1</b>	<b>D. Wiley</b>
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	<b>Dave Wiley</b> – Reviewed the new design.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(1:23) <b>Staff</b> – Read previous concerns from Sept. 1. Read John Lancaster’s letter into the record. <b>Camp</b> – Agree with what’s been said, except for the French doors; that is the back of the house. <b>McLaughlin</b> – Front door (facing Burnell Street) should be a standard 6-panel. <b>Williams</b> – Two French doors facing Burnell is completely inappropriate as it is wide open facing the street; one has to become a front door. Front elevation, should have corner boards; wings should not be flush with the front wall plane. South elevation, ganged windows need to be split and lined up; “this” running into the corner board doesn’t happen anywhere else on the house, you need to fix that. West elevation, set those pieces off with the windows smaller and to me one of these has to become some sort of pseudo door with no glass in it; and windows need to be unganged and lined up. Discussion about how to correct the windows crossing two masses.			
Motion	<b>Motion to Hold for revisions. (McLaughlin)</b>			
Vote	Carried unanimously	<b>Certificate #</b>		

6.	Oak Hill Investments	40 Long Pond Road – MAB	Move on	594-115	Emeritus
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Camp				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.				
Representing	<b>Alex Bagmet</b> , Emeritus Development – Reviewed the project.				
Public	None				
Concerns	(1:34) <b>Staff</b> – Read previous concerns from Sept. 17. <b>McLaughlin</b> – Would like to have the dormer roof to have a 7 pitch; the height will go up. <b>Camp</b> - No concerns. <b>McLaughlin</b> – Asked for a friendly amendment for the dormer over the front door a 7 pitch. (not accepted)				
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve as drawn. (Camp)</b>				
Vote	Carried 2-1/McLaughlin opposed		<b>Certificate #</b>	<b>60337</b>	
7.	Halberstam	12 Coffin Street – HSAB	Addition		Emeritus
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Camp				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.				
Representing	<b>Alex Bagmet</b> , Emeritus Development – Reviewed changes per previous concerns.				
Public	None				
Concerns	(1:38) <b>Staff</b> – Read previous concerns from Sept. 17. No concerns.				
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve. (Camp)</b>				
Vote	Carried unanimously		<b>Certificate #</b>	<b>60338</b>	
8.	Johnson	2 Hamblin Road	New dwelling	30-193	Emeritus
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Camp				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.				
Representing	<b>Alex Bagmet</b> , Emeritus Development – Reviewed changes per previous concerns.				
Public	None				
Concerns	(1:44) <b>Staff</b> – Read previous concerns from Sept. 17. <b>McLaughlin</b> – Point of order: commissioners should speak first. There are 14 casement windows, the “D” and “E” windows; there are too many. The 6-over-3 “C” windows are atypical for Nantucket. There is no section “behind here.” Meeting rails need to match the gutter line. <b>Camp</b> – Agree about the “C” windows. <b>Williams</b> – The massing has not improved and should be reworked. Narrowing the main mass did not help and the cross gable isn’t working. Roof walk is not appropriately located at the peak of the cross gables. On the front, the squat, hipped porch is not working; right hand dormer meeting rails need to align; the “A” windows are too large and too low. Agree about the “C” windows. On the rear, the deck is too big; “A” windows on right piece are too large.				
Motion	<b>Motion to Hold for revisions. (Camp)</b>				
Vote	Carried unanimously		<b>Certificate #</b>		
9.	Johnson	2 Hamblin Road	Move/demo	30-193	Emeritus
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Camp				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.				
Representing	<b>Alex Bagmet</b> , Emeritus Development – The move off was approved; now asking for the demolition.				
Public	None				
Concerns	(1:53) <b>Staff</b> – Read application specifications. No concerns.				
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve the demolition. (Camp)</b>				
Vote	Carried unanimously		<b>Certificate #</b>	<b>60339</b>	

10. Johnson	2 Hamblin Road	New garage	30-193	Emeritus
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Alex Bagmet, Emeritus Development			
Public	None			
Concerns	None			
Motion	<b>Motion to Hold the garage to track with the new dwelling. (Camp)</b>			
Vote	Carried unanimously		<b>Certificate #</b>	
11. Knutson	9 Dunham Street	Addition	80-196	BPC
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	<b>Joe Paul</b> , BPC – Reduced 2 <sup>nd</sup> -floor deck space; added muntins to the simulated divided light windows, not snap-ins; reduced the size of shower and centered.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(1:57) <b>Staff</b> – There are no prior minutes. Pointed out that the guidelines say white or grey, but the Rural Road guidelines says differently; it is probably something the commission should discuss at the organizational meeting. <b>Hill-Holdgate</b> – Would like the deck railings to be natural to weather, then she would not be concerned about the rest of the trim being white; structure is set back from Nonantum Avenue. <b>McLaughlin</b> – The application should indicate that the 6-lights are fixed. Okay with the white trim. <b>Camp</b> – White would make it stand out more but agree with Hill-Holdgate. <b>Williams</b> – White is not appropriate due to the plate window and 2 <sup>nd</sup> -floor decks and 10 French doors; white will accent the oddities.			
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve through staff with all 2<sup>nd</sup>-floor railing details to be natural to weather and the 6-light windows are to be fixed. (Hill-Holdgate)</b>			
Vote	Carried 3-1/Williams opposed		<b>Certificate #</b>	<b>60340</b>
12. Knutson	9 Dunham Street	Garage	80-196	BPC
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	<b>Joe Paul</b> , BPC – Presented project. If the building were flip-flopped, the stairs wouldn't overhang, the overall length could be against the building.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(2:09) <b>Staff</b> – Read application specifications. Discussion about where the access is from and how the massing relates to it. The driveway will be off Dunham instead of Weweeder. <b>Hill-Holdgate</b> – The exterior stairs should remain natural to weather; suggested they turn and go along the side of the structure. Discussion about flipping the structure. <b>McLaughlin</b> – The “D” window should be fixed. <b>Camp</b> – Agree with what's been said about the stairs; would like the garage doors changed to natural to weather. <b>Williams</b> – Doesn't like the new access layout as there is 200 feet of driveway that runs the length of the side of the lot.			
Motion	<b>Motion to Hold for revisions. (Hill-Holdgate)</b>			
Vote	Carried unanimously		<b>Certificate #</b>	

13. Knutson	9 Dunham Street	Hardscaping: pool	80-196	BPC
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	<b>Joe Paul</b> , BPC – Asked this to be held as revisions are being made.			
Public	None			
Concerns	<b>Hill-Holdgate</b> – In regards to site layout, the cabana should be situated to block out view of the pool from Weweeder. Concerned about putting a wire fence along Weweeder; it should be a wood fence. <b>Williams</b> – Agree about the fence; it should be tight to the pool.			
Motion	<b>Motion to Hold at applicant's request. (Hill-Holdgate)</b>			
Vote	Carried unanimously	<b>Certificate #</b>		
14. Knutson	9 Dunham Street	Cabana	80-196	BPC
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	<b>Joe Paul</b> , BPC – Asked this to be held as revisions are being made.			
Public	None			
Concerns	<b>Hill-Holdgate</b> – In regards to site layout, the cabana should be situated to block out view of the pool from Weweeder.			
Motion	<b>Motion to Hold at applicant's request. (Hill-Holdgate)</b>			
Vote	Carried unanimously	<b>Certificate #</b>		
15. Atlas RT	212 Eel Point Road	Hardscaping: pool	38-35	Atlantic Landsep.
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	<b>Lindsey Congelton</b> , Atlantic Landscaping – Not visible. The pool fence is standard black wire.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(2:16) <b>Staff</b> – Read previous concerns from Sept. 26. No concerns.			
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve due to lack of visibility. (Hill-Holdgate)</b>			
Vote	Carried unanimously	<b>Certificate #</b>	<b>60341</b>	
16. Minella, Amy	8 Giny Lane	Hardscaping	82-51	W. Yost
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns	(2:17) No quorum: missing Mr. Barham			
Motion	<b>Motion to Hold for beginning of October 8 meeting due to lack of quorum. (Camp)</b>			
Vote	Carried unanimously	<b>Certificate #</b>		

17. Miner	12 South Valley Road	Cottage	43-139	JMS Architecture
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	<b>Sarah Alger</b> , Sarah F. Alger P.C. – Reviewed changes per previous concerns.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(2:18) <b>Staff</b> – Read previous concerns from Sept. 17. <b>Williams</b> – Same concerns about the 2 gable dormer on the east elevation, it needs to be set back off the eave. No other commissioner concerns.			
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve through staff with the east elevation dormer set back off the eave to allow the eave to run across. (Camp)</b>			
Vote	Carried unanimously	<b>Certificate #</b>	<b>60342</b>	
18. Sarah Alger, N.T.	93 Squam Road	Rev COA 59862 (house)	13-1	Rowland
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	<b>Mickey Rowland</b> , Rowland and Associates – Reviewed changes per previous concerns <b>Sarah Alger</b> , Sarah F. Alger P.C., trustee – Doesn't think is appropriate to ask that a previously approved element to be changed.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(2:24) <b>Staff</b> – Read previous concerns from Sept 12. Discussion about the ganged windows over the front door and whether or not they should be changed.			
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve through staff with the west elevation windows over front door to remain ganged. (Camp)</b>			
Vote	Carried unanimously	<b>Certificate #</b>	<b>60343</b>	
19. Panner, Aaron	Crooked Lane (Lot 4)	Rev: COA #59915 (main hse)	41-205	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	<b>Lisa Botticelli</b> , Botticelli & Pohl – Reviewed changes per previous concerns.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(2:28) <b>Staff</b> – Read previous concerns from Sept. 12. No concerns.			
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve. (Camp)</b>			
Vote	Carried unanimously	<b>Certificate #</b>	<b>60344</b>	
20. FAO NT	29 Orange Street – HSAB	Renovation/additions	42.3.2-69	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	<b>Lisa Botticelli</b> , Botticelli & Pohl – Reviewed changes per previous concerns.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(2:31) <b>Staff</b> – Read previous concerns from Sept. 17. No concerns.			
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve. (Hill-Holdgate)</b>			
Vote	Carried unanimously	<b>Certificate #</b>	<b>60345</b>	

21. Cohan	81 Baxter Road – SAB	Move on-site, renovation	49-33	C & C
Sitting	Hill-Holdgate (acting chair), McLaughlin, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	<b>Jamie Feeley</b> , Cottage and Castle Construction – Reviewed changes per previous concerns.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(2:33) <b>Staff</b> – Read previous concerns from Sept. 19. No concerns.			
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve. (McLaughlin)</b>			
Vote	Carried unanimously	<b>Certificate #</b>	<b>60346</b>	
22. Burns, Brett	24 Nonantum Avenue	New dwelling	87-157	Emeritus
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns	(2:36) <b>Staff</b> – Applicant has asked to be held for Tuesday			
Motion	<b>Motion to Hold for October 8 meeting. (Hill-Holdgate)</b>			
Vote	Carried unanimously	<b>Certificate #</b>		
23. NHA	15R Vestal Street – HSAB	New sign: free-standing sign	73-133	Emeritus
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	<b>Marsha Feder</b> – Reviewed revisions made after talking to Mass Historical.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(2:37) <b>Staff</b> – Read previous concerns from Aug. 20. No concerns.			
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve through staff with Option 1 and sign to be removed by June 1, 2014. (Camp)</b>			
Vote	Carried unanimously	<b>Certificate #</b>	<b>60347</b>	
24. Hunter Trust	90 Pocomo Road	New dwelling	15-43	CWA
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Chip Webster, Chip Webster Architecture			
Public	None			
Concerns	(2:40) <b>Williams</b> – This is a big project and believes it should be held for Tuesday for all four people (Hill-Holdgate) will be able to sit.			
Motion	<b>Motion to Hold for beginning of October 8 meeting. (Camp)</b>			
Vote	Carried unanimously	<b>Certificate #</b>		
25. Hunter Trust	90 Pocomo Road	New second dwelling	15-43	CWA
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Chip Webster, Chip Webster Architecture			
Public	None			
Concerns	(2:40) No comments at this time.			
Motion	<b>Motion to Hold for beginning of October 8 meeting. (Camp)</b>			
Vote	Carried unanimously	<b>Certificate #</b>		

26. Hunter Trust 90 Pocomo Road New garage 15-43 CWA  
 Sitting Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Camp  
 Alternates None  
 Recused None  
 Documentation File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.  
 Representing Chip Webster, Chip Webster Architecture  
 Public None  
 Concerns (2:40) No comments at this time.  
 Motion **Motion to Hold for beginning of October 8 meeting. (Camp)**  
 Vote Carried unanimously **Certificate #**

27. Glenhurst West RT 137 Cliff Road New dwelling 30-259 CWA  
 Sitting Williams, McLaughlin, Camp  
 Alternates None  
 Recused None  
 Documentation File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.  
 Representing **Chip Webster**, Chip Webster Architecture – Wants to go forward with it today.  
**Steven Cohen**, Reade, Gullicksen, Hanley, Gifford & Cohen LLP – This has been repeatedly delayed. Wants it to go forward today.  
 Public None  
 Concerns (2:43) **Williams** – Again suggested holding this to Tuesday for the full board.  
**Staff** – Read previous concerns from Sept. 17.  
**McLaughlin** – Stated that he had requested cross sections on the angled wings and they have not been included.  
 Motion **Motion to Hold without comment for October 8. (McLaughlin)**  
 Vote Carried unanimously **Certificate #**

#### VIII. OTHER BUSINESS

Approve Minutes	August 20 and 22 and September 3, 5, 12, 17 and 19 <b>Motion to Approve.</b> (McLaughlin) 2-1/Williams opposed
Review Minutes	September 24
Other Business	Organizational meeting October 29 <sup>th</sup> with the regular meeting schedule adjusted.
Commission Comments	None

Motion to Adjourn: 2:52 p.m.

Submitted by:  
 Terry L. Norton

HSAB – Historic Structures Advisory Board SAB – ‘Sconset Advisory Board  
 TAB – Tuckernuck Advisory Board MAB – Madaket Advisory Board